



CITY OF EUREKA
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT
Rob Holmlund, AICP, Director

531 K Street, Third Floor
Eureka, California 95501-1146
(707) 441-4160 • planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov
www.ci.eureka.ca.gov

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that the Historic Preservation Commission will hold a public hearing on **Wednesday, February 6, 2019**, at 4:00 p.m., or as soon thereafter as the matter can be heard, in the Council Chamber, Eureka City Hall, 531 “K” Street, Eureka, California, to consider the following application:

Project Title: Municipal Auditorium Rehabilitation

Project Applicant: City of Eureka **Case No:** HPO-19-0002

Project Location: 1120 F Street **APN:** 004-232-001

Project Zoning and Land Use: P (Public)/PQP (Public/Quasi-Public)

Project Description: The City of Eureka is pursuing a 2018 Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) to expand the availability of homeless services by utilizing the second floor of the Eureka Municipal Auditorium (the Muni). If granted, the funding will be used to create a secure and accessible entrance to a new interior elevator at the south (12th Street) side of the structure. An existing window will be removed and replaced with a door, and a porch overhang will be added. Rehabilitation of the remaining existing windows may also be undertaken.

All interested persons are invited to comment either in person at the scheduled public hearing, or in writing. Written comments may be submitted prior to or during the hearing by mailing or delivering them to the Development Services Department, Third Floor, 531 K Street, Eureka. Appeals to the City Council of the action of the Historic Preservation Commission, may be made within 10 calendar days of the action by filing a written Notice of Appeal, along with the filing fees as set by the City Council, with the City Clerk.

If you challenge the nature of the proposed action in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues that you or someone else raised at the public hearing or written correspondence received during or prior to the public hearing. Accommodations for handicapped access to City meetings must be requested of the City Clerk, 441-4175, five working days in advance of the meeting. The project file is available for review at the Development Services Department. If you have questions regarding the project or this notice, please contact Kristen M. Goetz, Senior Planner, kgoetz@ci.eureka.ca.gov or (707) 441-4160.



CITY OF EUREKA
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT
Rob Holmlund, AICP, Director
Kristen M. Goetz, Senior Planner
Community Development Division
531 K Street • Eureka, California 95501-1146
Ph (707) 441-4166 • Fx (707) 441-4202
kgoetz@ci.eureka.ca.gov • www.ci.eureka.ca.gov

CITY OF EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

February 6, 2019

Project Title: Municipal Auditorium Rehabilitation

Project Applicant: City of Eureka **Case No:** HPO-19-0002

Project Location: 1120 F Street **APN:** 004-232-001

Project Zoning and Land Use: P (Public)/PQP (Public/Quasi-Public)

Project Description: The City of Eureka is pursuing a 2018 Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) to expand the availability of homeless services by utilizing the second floor of the Eureka Municipal Auditorium (the Muni). If granted, the funding will be used to create a secure and accessible entrance to a new interior elevator at the south (12th Street) side of the structure. An existing window will be removed and replaced with a door, and a porch overhang will be added. Rehabilitation of the remaining existing windows may also be undertaken.

Contact Person: Kristen M. Goetz, Senior Planner; phone: (707) 441-4160; fax: (707) 441-4202; email: kgoetz@ci.eureka.ca.gov

Staff Recommendation: Adopt a resolution of the Historic Preservation Commission approving with the conditions the exterior modifications to the Municipal Auditorium at 1120 F Street.

Motion: *“I move the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a Resolution conditionally approving the exterior modifications to the Municipal Auditorium at 1120 F Street.”*

Background:

The Municipal Auditorium (the Muni) property is included on the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP) and is currently owned by the City of Eureka. According to the “Green Book”, the structure at 1120 F Street is a circa 1935 concrete Moderne public building and was a Works Progress Administration (WPA) project. According to Wikipedia, the WPA was an agency created in 1935 as a result of President Franklin D. Roosevelt’s New Deal. The WPA employed millions of mostly unskilled workers to carry out public works projects, including construction of public buildings and roads¹.

¹ Unless noted otherwise, all photos borrowed from Facebook page “Remember in Eureka when...”

The Muni occupies the entire block bounded by 11th and 12th Streets, and E and F Streets in Eureka. The eastern side of the building contains an auditorium used for public events. The western side of the facility, facing E Street is part of the two-story Winship Public School.





According to comments on Facebook page *Remember in Eureka when...*, and a 1984 Humboldt Historian Article by Glen Nash, this site was the site of Grant School in the 1870's. The school structure was a one-story, four room structure and existed on the site for 12-14 years before it was moved, using planking and cribbing and rollers, to 14th and William Streets to make way for construction of Winship School. The Winship Elementary School was opened in 1890 and became the first high school in the County in 1896. It changed to a middle school in 1914 and was closed in 1926 and eventually demolished in 1926.

The Winship portion of the building is currently used by the City for several city services, and a large portion of the building is storage. In order to facilitate homeless programs operated by the Community Access Program for Eureka (CAPE), and other non-profit organizations serving the City's low- and moderate-income community, the City is requesting funding from the California Department of Housing and Community Development through the CDBG program.



If granted, the CDBG funding would be used to create a secure and accessible entrance to a new interior elevator on the south (12th Street) side of the structure, to add accessible restroom facilities to and remodel the second floor, as well as improve the equipment in the commercial kitchen located in the auditorium (F Street side). The priority for the CDBG project is the retrofit of the Muni for the CAPE program, but if funding allows, the City would also rehabilitate the remaining windows. Improvements envisioned for the Muni include, but are not limited to, the following:

- Interior elevator (12th Street side)
- Accessible parking space (12th Street side)
- Accessible ramp to public way (12th Street side)
- Accessible restrooms (second floor)
- Secured entrance (second floor)
- Interior remodel (second floor)
- New flooring (entrance and second floor)
- New paint on interior (entrance and second floor)
- New equipment (commercial kitchen located in auditorium)
- Exterior paint (entire building)
- Rehabilitation of windows

Proposed Modifications



Google Street View April 2012

ADA access to the second floor is required for the CAPE homeless programs, and installation of an elevator is proposed on the interior of the building. However, to provide access to the elevator, the window adjacent to the existing entrance on 12th Street will be removed, and replaced with a door. The metal overhang above the existing door will be removed, and a new overhang will be added.



Engineer's Renderings



An accessible path of travel from the new ADA parking space to the street will be installed along the perimeter of the north and east edges of the parking lot.

REQUIRED FINDINGS: Title XV, Chapter 157 of the Eureka Municipal Code, Section 157.07 (C), specifies alterations to properties listed on the Local Register of Historic Places must be considered in light of its effect on the existing historical character of the affected structure as

it relates to the streetscape. Also as provided in Chapter 157, the Historic Preservation Commission has adopted the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* as the guidelines for alterations to historic properties and in carrying out their historic preservation responsibilities.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards were developed to promote consistent preservation practices. The intent of the Standards is to assist the long-term preservation of a property's significance through the preservation of historic materials and features. The Standards are neither technical nor prescriptive, but are intended to promote responsible preservation practices that help protect cultural resources. In the Standards, there are four ways that a historic property may be treated; they include Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction.

Preservation focuses on the maintenance and repair of existing historic materials and retention of a property's form as it has evolved over time. Rehabilitation acknowledges the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or changing uses while retaining the property's historic character as it has evolved over time. Restoration depicts a property at a particular period of time in its history, while removing evidence of other periods. Finally, Reconstruction re-creates vanished or non-surviving portions of a property for interpretive purposes.

The most appropriate standard to use for reviewing this proposed project is Rehabilitation. Rehabilitation emphasizes the retention and repair of historic materials, but also acknowledges time moves forward and properties change, and allows additions so long as the essential historic character on the parcel remains. Contemporary or non-historic materials may be used in the construction where the same materials would be impractical. Rehabilitation focuses more on how people continue to use and adapt properties according to changing needs than on historical interpretation.

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. There are 10 standards to consider when determining if Rehabilitation is the appropriate method of preserving a historic resource. They are:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The historic use of the property as a public building will remain unchanged. Removing the window and adding the door and overhang will not affect the spatial relationship of the property to adjacent residential properties.

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The overall character of the property will be unchanged. The removal of the window and addition of the door and overhang will slightly alter the features of the structure, but will also identify these as later modifications to the structure.

- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding*

conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

No conjectural features or elements from other historic properties have been or will be added to the property.

- 4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

There have been no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right.

- 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

Other than the removal of the window, the distinctive features of the structure will remain.

- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

If funding allows, deteriorated windows will be rehabilitated.

- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

No chemical or physical treatments have or will occur.

- 8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

Ground disturbance will occur within the existing footprint of the structure for the elevator, and excavation is anticipated to be 2 feet; ground disturbance for the accessible path of travel will be 1 foot. If archeological resources are discovered during construction, appropriate action will be undertaken.

- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Except for the removal of the window, the proposed alterations will not destroy materials or features that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old by the installation of the porch overhang. No other

original entries to the structure have overhangs, and the overhang installed over the adjacent door to the building will be removed and replaced by the proposed porch overhang. The slope and width of the overhang is similar to the slope and overhang of the roof, and will be covered with the same clay roofing tiles.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

If necessary, restoration of the original window and wall finish could be accomplished by removal of the overhang and door.

Based on the discussion for each standard above, the removal of the window and addition of the door and overhang, as well as the rehabilitation of the windows, if funded, comply with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

The Historic Preservation Commission should review the proposed project to determine whether it is appropriate for the parcel. If the Committee concurs with Staff's analysis and recommendation above, and with the conclusion that the proposed project generally complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Staff recommends that the following condition of approval be added to project approval:

1. The applicant shall undertake the project as described herein and as approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Any deviation in proposed design, architectural style, or exterior appearance from those currently proposed shall have prior approval.

If the Commission determines that the proposed project with the condition listed above does not follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, it is recommended that the Commission adopt conditions of approval to specify what design, architectural style, exterior colors, and exterior appearance should be used for the proposed project.

Environmental: Approval of this project is subject to environmental review in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A project that complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents. If this project, or a portion thereof, is determined to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, then the project or portion qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from CEQA. This project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards because, to the extent possible, historic materials will be retained and repaired, and although time is moving forward and the property's use is changing, the required alteration to the exterior of the structure can be accomplished without substantially changing the historic character of the building. The project therefore qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from CEQA.

Recommended Motion

"I move the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a Resolution approving the exterior modification and rehabilitation of the Municipal Auditorium."

Support Material:

Attachment 1 Historic Preservation Commission Resolution

RESOLUTION NO. 2019-__

**A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
OF THE CITY OF EUREKA APPROVING WITH CONDITIONS THE EXTERIOR
MODIFICATIONS TO THE MUNICIPAL AUDITORIUM AT 1120 F STREET**

WHEREAS, the Municipal Auditorium building (the Muni), owned by the City of Eureka, located at 1120 F Street, and occupying the entire block bounded by 11th and 12th Streets, and E and F Streets in Eureka, is listed on the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP); and

WHEREAS, according to the "Green Book", the structure is a circa 1935 concrete Moderne public building and was a Works Progress Administration (WPA) project; and

WHEREAS, the eastern side of the building contains an auditorium used for public events, and the two-story western side of the facility, facing E Street, is the former Winship Public School; and

WHEREAS, the Winship portion of the building is currently used by the City for several city services, and a large portion of the building is storage; and

WHEREAS, the City is requesting funding from the California Department of Housing and Community Development through the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program to facilitate homeless programs operated by the Community Access Program for Eureka (CAPE), and other non-profit organizations serving the City's low- and moderate-income community, and

WHEREAS, the CDBG funding would be used to create a secure and accessible entrance to a new interior elevator on the south (12th Street) side of the structure, to add accessible restroom facilities to and remodel the second floor, as well as improve the equipment in the commercial kitchen located in the auditorium (F Street side); and

WHEREAS, if funding allows, the City proposes to rehabilitate the windows in the entire structure; and

WHEREAS, installation of the elevator on the interior of the structure requires removal of a window and replacement with a door on the exterior 12th Street side; and

WHEREAS, the City also proposes to install a porch overhang above both doors on the south side of the Muni; and

WHEREAS, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards were developed to promote consistent preservation practices, and the intent of the Standards is to assist the long-term preservation of a property's significance through the preservation of historic materials and features; and

WHEREAS, the most appropriate standard to use for reviewing this project is Rehabilitation; and

WHEREAS, rehabilitation emphasizes the retention and repair of historic materials, but also acknowledges that time moves forward and properties change, and that additions may be made so long as the essential historic character on the parcel remains; and

WHEREAS, contemporary or non-historic materials may be used in the construction where the same materials would be impractical; and

WHEREAS, the project is subject to environmental review in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka, that the decision to conditionally approve the project was made after careful, reasoned and equitable consideration of the evidence in the record, including, but not limited to: written and oral testimony submitted at the public hearing; the staff report; site investigation(s); project file; and, the evidence submitted with the permit application. The findings of fact listed below “bridge the analytical gap” between the raw evidence in the record and the Historic Preservation Commission’s decision.

1. The historic use of the property as a public building will remain unchanged, and spatial relationships to adjacent parcels are not affected.
2. Removing the window and adding the door and porch overhang will not change the overall character of the property.
3. No conjectural features or elements from other historic properties have been or will be added to the property.
4. There have been no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right.
5. Other than the removal of the window, the distinctive features of the structure will remain.
6. If funding allows, deteriorated windows will be rehabilitated.
7. No chemical or physical treatments have or will occur.
8. Archeological resources, if any, will be protected and preserved.
9. Except for the removal of the window, the proposed alterations will not destroy materials or features that characterize the property.
10. The new work will be differentiated from the old by the installation of the porch overhang.
11. No other original entries on the structure have overhangs, and the overhang installed over the adjacent door to the building will be removed and replaced by the proposed porch overhang.
12. The slope and width of the overhang is similar to the slope and overhang of the roof, and will be covered with the same clay roofing tiles.
13. Restoration of the original window and wall finish could be accomplished by removal of the overhang and door.

14. The project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from CEQA.

FURTHER, approval is conditioned on the following terms and requirements. The violation of any term or requirement of this conditional approval may result in the revocation of the permit.

1. The applicant shall undertake the project as described herein and as approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Any deviation in proposed design, architectural style, or exterior appearance from those currently proposed shall have prior approval.
2. Should archeological resources be discovered during ground disturbance, all work within 50 feet of the resource will cease and the contractor will notify the City of Eureka who will retain a qualified archeologist to evaluate and assess the significance of the discovery, and develop and implement an avoidance or mitigation plan, as appropriate.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka in the County of Humboldt, State of California, on the 6th day of February, 2019 by the following vote:

AYES: COMMISSIONER
NOES: COMMISSIONER
ABSENT: COMMISSIONER
ABSTAIN: COMMISSIONER

Ted Loring, Chair, Historic Preservation Commission

Attest:

Kristen M. Goetz, Executive Secretary