



CITY OF EUREKA
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT
Rob Holmlund, AICP, Director

531 K Street, Third Floor
Eureka, California 95501-1146
(707) 441-4160 • planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov
www.ci.eureka.ca.gov

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that the Eureka Design Review Committee will hold a public hearing on **Wednesday, September 4, 2019**, at 4:00 p.m., or as soon thereafter as the matter can be heard, in the Council Chamber, Eureka City Hall, 531 “K” Street, Eureka, California, to consider the following application:

Project Title: Alfano Carriage House Renovations

Project Applicant: Devin Medrud **Case No:** HP-19-0002

Project Location: 2615 I Street **APN:** 011-043-008

Project Zoning and Land Use: R1 (Low Density Residential)/LDR (Low Density Residential)

Project Description: The property owners are seeking after-the-fact approval for renovations, undertaken by the previous owner, that were made to the property’s detached garage and upstairs ADU. The two-story carriage house has been modified to match the primary residence. Renovations include the replacement of four windows and the addition of a covered entry to the carriage house’s downstairs, west entry.

All interested persons are invited to comment either in person at the scheduled public hearing, or in writing. Written comments may be submitted prior to or during the hearing by mailing or delivering them to the Development Services Department, Third Floor, 531 K Street, Eureka. Appeals to the City Council of the action of the Historic Preservation Committee, may be made within 10 calendar days of the action by filing a written Notice of Appeal, along with the filing fees as set by the City Council, with the City Clerk.

If you challenge the nature of the proposed action in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues that you or someone else raised at the public hearing or written correspondence received during or prior to the public hearing. Accommodations for handicapped access to City meetings must be requested of the City Clerk, 441-4175, five working days in advance of the meeting. The project file is available for review at the Development Services Department. If you have questions regarding the project or this notice, please contact Riley Topolewski, Senior Planner, rtopolewski@ci.eureka.ca.gov or (707) 268-1971.



CITY OF EUREKA
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT
Rob Holmlund, AICP, Director
Riley Topolewski, Senior Planner
531 K Street • Eureka, California 95501-1146
Ph (707) 441-4160
planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov • www.ci.eureka.ca.gov

CITY OF EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

September 4, 2019

Project Title: Alfano Carriage House Renovations

Project Applicant: Devin Medrud **Case No:** HP-19-0002

Project Location: 2615 I Street **APN:** 011-043-008

Project Zoning and Land Use: R1 (Low Density Residential)/LDR (Low Density Residential)

Project Description: The property owners are seeking after-the-fact approval for renovations, undertaken by the previous owner, that were made to the property's detached garage and upstairs ADU. The two-story carriage house has been modified to match the primary residence. Renovations that require Historic Preservation Commission approval include the replacement of two windows on the west side and the addition of a door and covered entry to the carriage house's downstairs, west side. Per Eureka Municipal Code EMC §157.006 (C), the proposed project requires review and approval by the Historic Preservation Commission].

Contact Person: Riley Topolewski, Senior Planner; phone: (707) 268-1971; email: rtopolewski@ci.eureka.ca.gov

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Commission adopt a Resolution conditionally approving the rehabilitation.

Recommended Motion: *"I move that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a Resolution of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka conditionally approving the carriage house rehabilitation at 2615 I Street, APN 011-043-008."*

Background:

The property is included on the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP) and is currently owned by Angelo Alfano. The parcel contains a 91-year-old dwelling and carriage house. Based upon the architecture, it is estimated that the carriage house was constructed in the same time period as the primary dwelling (1949 Sanborn maps show the main structure and carriage house.) The "Green Book" lists 2615 I Street as a "one-story Colonial Revival house with flattened arched entry porch and gambrel roof (pg 180)."

In June, 2014, the Historic Preservation Commission approved the rehabilitation of fire damaged sections of the carriage house, and an unpermitted attached shop. Rehabilitation included removal and reconstruction of the fire damaged roof and second story of the carriage house and the parapet roof on

the shop, reconfiguration of the footprint of the shop to meet setback requirements, and installation of vinyl double pane windows.

Subsequently, a building permit was issued for demolition of the fire-damaged portions of the carriage house, and for unknown reasons, the property owner demolished the entire attached shop and it was not reconstructed. The previous owner did make renovations which included the rehabilitation of the fire damaged carriage house. As prescribed by the Historic Preservation Commission on 6/4/2014, the configuration of the original window layout on the second floor was retained.

In order to move forward, the current owner is proposing to legalize the work that has been done on the carriage house, which includes a new door, porch, and two windows on the west side of the structure. The two new windows are vinyl double pane to match the rest of the existing windows. The covered roof on the new, downstairs entry utilizes similar angles to that of the main house's front entry, thus creating a relationship between the two structures.

Site Images:



Figure 1: Carriage House Current



Figure 2: Carriage House from 2014 With Fire Damage



Figure 3: Main House Current West Elevation



Figure 4: Main House from 2014

Required Findings and Analysis:

Title 15, Chapter 157, of the Eureka Municipal Code, Section 157.006(C), specifies that for properties listed on the Local Register of Historic Places, a proposed alteration must be considered in light of its effect on the existing historical character of the affected structure as it relates to the streetscape. Also as provided in Chapter 157, the Historic Preservation Commission has adopted the ***Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*** as the guidelines for alterations to historic properties and in carrying out their historic preservation responsibilities.

In the Standards, there are four ways that a historic property may be treated; they include Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction. The most appropriate standard for this project is Rehabilitation. Rehabilitation acknowledges the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or changing uses while retaining the property's historic character as it has evolved over time. This treatment standard is chosen by staff because the proposal will alter a historic structure to meet continuing uses while retaining the structure's historic character.

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural significance when possible. There are ten standards to consider when determining if Rehabilitation is the appropriate method of preserving a historic resource:

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The carriage house was historically used as a residence and will continue to host this use. The current use of the property will not be changed in relation to this proposed project.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The overall historic character of the carriage house will be retained and the spatial relationship of the property will endure as the carriage house matches the form and style of the main house.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The rehabilitation does not include the addition of any features or elements which would create a false sense of historical development. The intent of the project is to rehabilitate the carriage house after extensive fire damage occurred.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

There are no known changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The rehabilitated carriage house, minus the removed, unpermitted side shop, demonstrates construction techniques and craftsmanship that characterize the main house.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Given the severe fire damage, replacement was the best option. The existing window configuration has been retained and the new siding has been updated to match the main house in color and style. The roofline and trim are identical to the previous design of the carriage house, prior to receiving fire damage.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

No chemical or physical treatments occurred during the rehabilitation of the carriage house.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

No ground disturbing activities are proposed.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The renovated carriage house and removal of the shop restores the spatial relationship of the property and is compatible with the historic materials, size, scale, and proportion thereby protecting the integrity of the property and its environment.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

No new additions or adjacent construction is proposed.

Summary of Findings: Based on the discussion for each standard above, the renovation of the carriage house complies with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

The Historic Preservation Commission should review the proposed project to determine whether it is appropriate for the parcel. If the Committee concurs with Staff's analysis and recommendation above, and with the conclusion that the proposed project generally complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Staff recommends that the following condition of approval be added to project approval:

1. The applicant shall obtain all the necessary building permits to cover the work that has been, or will be completed.

If the Commission determines that the proposed project with the condition listed above does not follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, it is recommended that the Commission adopt conditions of approval to specify what design, architectural style, exterior colors, and/or exterior appearance should be used for the proposed project.

With the recommended conditions of approval, Staff believes the proposed project components meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, as discussed above. The proposed rehabilitation will enhance the spatial relationship of the carriage house and main house.

Staff Recommendation: The Historic Preservation Commission should review the proposed project to determine whether Rehabilitation is appropriate for the treatment of the structure. If the Commission concurs with Staff's analysis, it is recommended that the Commission adopt a Resolution of the Historic Preservation Commission conditionally approving the project. Otherwise, the Commission should craft findings and conditions supporting their action.

Environmental: This project is subject to environmental review in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A project that complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents. Because the alteration will match the old in design and color and it will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource, this project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from CEQA.

Recommended Motion: *“I move that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a Resolution of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka conditionally approving the carriage house rehabilitation at 2615 I Street, APN 011-043-008.”*

Support Material:

Attachment A Resolutionpages 8-9

RESOLUTION NO. 2019-____

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF EUREKA
CONDITIONALLY APPROVING THE CARRIAGE HOUSE REHABILITATION AT 2615 I STREET,
APN 011-043-008.

WHEREAS, the subject property at 2615 I Street is included on the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP); and

WHEREAS, according to the “Green Book”, the residence is described as a “one-story Colonial Revival house with flattened arched entry porch and gambrel roof”; and

WHEREAS, the applicant has submitted an application requesting approval, after the fact, for renovations to the detached carriage house; and

WHEREAS, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards were developed to promote consistent preservation practices, and the intent of the Standards is to assist the long-term preservation of a property's significance through the preservation of historic materials and features; and

WHEREAS, the most appropriate standard to use for reviewing this project is Rehabilitation; and

WHEREAS, rehabilitation emphasizes the retention and repair of historic materials, but also acknowledges that time moves forward and properties change, and that additions may be made so long as the essential historic character on the parcel remains; and

WHEREAS, contemporary or non-historic materials may be used in the construction where the same materials would be impractical; and

WHEREAS, the project is subject to environmental review in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA); and

WHEREAS, a project that complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka did hold a duly noticed public hearing in the Council Chamber of Eureka City Hall at 531 K Street, Eureka, on September 4, 2019, at 4:00 p.m., to consider the subject application; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka has reviewed the subject application in accordance with Eureka Municipal Code Chapter 157, and after due consideration of all testimony, evidence, and reports offered at the public hearing, does hereby find and determine the following facts:

1. That the historic residential use of the property will remain unchanged.
2. That the renovations to the carriage house will not affect the spatial relationship of the property to adjacent residential structures.

3. That no conjectural features or elements from other historic properties have been or will be added to the property.
4. That there have been no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right.
5. That no chemical or physical treatments have or will occur.
6. That all work has and will occur within the existing footprint of the structure, and no ground disturbing activities are proposed.
7. That no new additions or adjacent construction are proposed.
8. That the project, as conditioned, will be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka that the project, as described in the Staff Report, is approved, and the decision to approve the subject application was made after careful, reasoned and equitable consideration of the evidence in the record, including, but not limited to: written and oral testimony submitted at the public hearing; the staff report; site investigation(s); project file; and, the evidence submitted with the permit application.

FURTHER, approval of the project by the Historic Preservation Commission is conditioned on the following terms and requirements. The violation of any term or requirement of this conditional approval may result in the revocation of the permit.

1. The applicant shall obtain all the necessary building permits to cover the work that has been, or will be completed.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka in the County of Humboldt, State of California, on the 4TH day of September, 2019 by the following vote:

AYES:
NOES:
ABSENT:
ABSTAIN:

Ted Loring, Chair, Historic Preservation Commission

Attest:

Kristen M. Goetz, Executive Secretary