NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Notice is hereby given that the Historic Preservation Commission will hold a public hearing on Wednesday, June 3, 2020, at 4:00 p.m., or as soon thereafter as the matter can be heard. Pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20, by Governor Gavin Newson, this meeting will be conducted telephonically through Zoom. Please be advised that pursuant to the Executive Order and to ensure the health and safety of the public by limiting human contact that could spread the COVID-19 virus, City Hall will not be open for the meeting.

Project Title: Dunlap Handrail Installation

Project Applicant: Brian Dunlap (Authorized Agent)  Case No: HP-20-0007

Project Location: 715 16th Street  APN: 005-045-017

Project Zoning and Land Use: R3 (Residential High) and HDR (High Density Residential)

Project Description: The applicant is proposing the installation of an exterior handrail on the existing brick steps (added in 1976) on the main entrance of the structure for safety (VA lending requirements).

The public is invited to participate in the following manner:

1. You can view the Historic Preservation Commission meetings live on the City of Eureka’s website at www.ci.eureka.ca.gov or on Cable Channel 10. To view from the website, select Agendas, Meeting and Videos on the home page.
2. If you wish to speak and be heard during the hearing or oral communications, please submit your name, phone number and name of the item you would like to comment on by e-mail to planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov or leave a message at 707-441-4160 on or before June 3, 2020 at 12:00 p.m. A Development Services staff member will call you during the public hearing for the item.
3. If you don’t want to participate during the meeting but want to submit comment on a project or for oral communications, please submit your comment via email to planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov or you may leave a message at 707-441-4160 prior to June 3, 2020 at 12:00 p.m. to ensure that the Commission receives your comment before the meeting. All comments received by email or mail will be part of the public record for consideration but will not be read aloud during the meeting.
Appeals to the City Council of the action of the Historic Preservation Commission, may be made within 10 calendar days of the action by filing a written Notice of Appeal, along with the filing fees as set by the City Council, with the City Clerk.

If you challenge the nature of the proposed action in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues that you or someone else raised at the public hearing or written correspondence received during or prior to the public hearing. Accommodations for handicapped access to City meetings must be requested of the City Clerk, 441-4175, five working days in advance of the meeting. The project file is available for review at the Development Services Department. If you have questions regarding the project or this notice, please contact Lisa Savage, Project Manager, lsavage@ci.eureka.ca.gov or (707) 441-4186.
CITY of EUREKA

CITY OF EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT
June 3, 2020

Project Title: Dunlap Handrail Installation

Project Applicant: Brian Dunlap (Authorized Agent)       Case No: HP-20-0007

Project Location: 715 16th Street                  APN: 005-045-007

Project Zoning and Land Use: R3 (Residential High) and HDR (High Density Residential)

Project Description: The applicant is proposing the installation of an exterior hand rail on the existing brick steps (added in 1976) on the main entrance of the structure for safety (VA lending requirements). Per Eureka Municipal Code (EMC), the proposed project requires review, approval, and recommendation by the Historic Preservation Commission [§157.006 (C)].

Contact Person: Lisa Savage, Project Manager; phone: (707) 441-4186; email: lsavage@ci.eureka.ca.gov

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends the Commission hold a public hearing, and approve the project with conditions.

Suggested Motion: “I move the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a resolution approving the installation of a handrail to the front steps of 715 16th Street as conditioned.”

Background: The property is on the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP) and is currently owned by Gail Seeds. According to the “Green Book”, the structure was constructed in 1904 and is described as a “one-story symmetrical Colonial Revival cottage with dormer”.

The property, located at 715 16th Street, (Figure 1) is under contract for purchase and in order to meet VA lending requirements a hand rail must be installed on the existing brick steps on the main entrance of the structure (Figure 2). The original steps had concrete sides; however, based on the photograph it cannot be discerned if the treads were concrete or wood (Figure 3). The brick steps were added during permitted repairs in 1976, prior to being listed on the Local Register of Historic Places. The proposed hand rail will be black wrought iron, similar stylistically to wrought iron fencing and railing mimicking the historic character of the time. The hand rail will look similar to the hand rail installed on the historic Cornelius Daly House located at 1125 H Street (Figure 4),
Site Images:

Figure 1: Front House- 16th Street
Figure 2: Rendering of steps with hand rail (photos courtesy of applicant)

Figure 3: Circa 1904 photograph of house showing original steps.
Figure 4: Local Register of Historic Places, Cornelius Daly House with similar steps and hand rail (photos courtesy of applicant)

Required Findings and Analysis:
Title 15, Chapter 157, of the Eureka Municipal Code, Section 157.006(C), specifies that for properties listed on the Local Register of Historic Places, a proposed alteration must be considered in light of its effect on the existing historical character of the affected structure as it relates to the streetscape. Also, as provided in Chapter 157, the Historic Preservation Commission has adopted the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties as the guidelines for alterations to historic properties and in carrying out their historic preservation responsibilities.

In the Standards, there are four ways that a historic property may be treated; they include Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction. The most appropriate standard for this project is Rehabilitation. Rehabilitation acknowledges the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or changing uses while retaining the property’s historic character as it has evolved over time. This treatment standard is chosen by staff because the proposal will alter a historic structure to meet continuing uses while retaining the structure’s historic character.

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural significance when possible. There are ten standards to consider when determining if Rehabilitation is the appropriate method of preserving a historic resource:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

The main structure was historically used as a residence and will continue to host this use. The current use of the property will not be changed as a result of this proposed project.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The overall historic character of the property will be retained and preserved as the only change to the exterior façade is the installation of a hand rail on the center of the front steps which are not original to the structure. There will be no removal of distinctive materials. Although the addition of the hand rail will slightly alter the features, space, and spatial relationships that characterize the property, installing the hand rail down the center of the steps will provide symmetry that will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the cottage form.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposal will not include any additions which would create a false sense of historical development. The intent of the project is to maintain the current appearance of the structure with the exception of the addition of the hand rail to the front steps for safety.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

There are no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. The brick steps were added in 1976 and to Staff’s knowledge have not acquired historic significance. The wrought iron hand rail will only be attached to the brick step and front walkway and not the historic structure.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The installation of a hand rail will not alter or destroy any distinctive materials or features that characterize the structure. The hand rail will be attached to the center of the brick steps which are not original to the structure, and will not be attached to any part the original structure. Attaching the hand rail to the center of the structure will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the cottage form.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

No deteriorated historic features are known to exist or will be repaired or replaced.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

No chemical or physical treatments will occur during the installation of the hand rail. Painting of the hand rail will occur off-site, prior to installation.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

No ground disturbing activities are proposed.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed installation of the hand rail will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property as it will be attached to brick steps that are not original to the property. Although the new handrail is different from other railings on the house, which are wood balusters, it is similar stylistically to wrought iron fencing and railing from the historic period. In addition, attaching the hand rail to the center of the structure will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the cottage form.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With the exception of the hand rail, no other new additions and adjacent or related new construction is proposed. The hand rail could potentially be removed in the future and not change the integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Summary of Findings: Based on the discussion for each standard above, Staff believes the addition of the wrought iron hand rail to the front steps does comply with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

The Historic Preservation Commission should review the proposed project to determine whether it is appropriate for the parcel. If the Commission concurs with Staff’s analysis above, and concludes the proposed project does comply with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Commission could approve the application.

If the Commission chooses to impose conditions of their own, the Commission must adopt findings supporting their action, and conditions of approval to specify any action that must be taken, including identifying the design, architectural style, and exterior appearance that should be used for the proposed project.

Environmental: This project is subject to environmental review in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A project that complies with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents. Because the alteration will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource, this project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from CEQA.
**Recommended Motion:**

“I move the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a resolution approving the installation of a handrail to the front steps of 715 16th Street as conditioned.”

**Support Material:**
Attachment 1  Resolution ..............................................pages 8-9
WHEREAS, the subject property at 715 16th Street is included on the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP); and

WHEREAS, according to the "Green Book", the residence was constructed in 1904 and is described as a one-story symmetrical Colonial Revival cottage with dormer; and

WHEREAS, the Authorized Agent has submitted an application and requested approval to install a black wrought iron hand rail for safety on the front brick steps of a historic property located at 715 16th Street (APN 005-045-007); and

WHEREAS, due to Executive Order N-29-20, by Governor Gavin Newson, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka did hold a duly noticed public hearing telephonically via Zoom on June 3, 2020 at 4:00 p.m.; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka has reviewed the subject application in accordance with Eureka Municipal Code Chapter 157, and after due consideration of all testimony, evidence, and reports offered at the public hearing, does hereby find and determine the following facts:

1. The historic residential use of the property will remain unchanged.
2. The overall historic character of the property will be retained and preserved. There will be no removal of distinctive materials. Although the addition of the hand rail will slightly alter the features, space, and spatial relationships that characterize the property, installing the hand rail down the center of the steps will provide symmetry that will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the cottage form.
3. The proposal will not include any additions which would create a false sense of historical development. The intent of the project is to maintain the current appearance of the structure with the exception of the addition of the hand rail to the front steps.
4. There are no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. The brick steps were added in 1976 and to Staff’s knowledge have not acquired historic significance. The wrought iron hand rail will only be attached to the brick step and front walkway and not the historic structure.
5. The installation of a hand rail will not alter or destroy any distinctive materials or features that characterize the structure. The hand rail will be attached to the center of the brick steps which are not original to the structure, and will not be attached to any part the original structure. Attaching the hand rail to the center of the structure will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the cottage form.
6. No deteriorated historic features are known to exist or will be repaired or replaced.
7. No chemical or physical treatments have or will occur.
8. All work has and will occur within the existing footprint of the structure, and no ground disturbing activities are proposed.
9. The proposed installation of the hand rail will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property as it will be attached to brick steps that are not original to the property. Although the new handrail is different from other railings on the house, which are wood balusters, it is similar stylistically to wrought iron fencing and railing from the historic period. In addition, attaching the hand rail to the center of the structure will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the cottage form.
10. With the exception of the hand rail, no other new additions and adjacent or related new construction is proposed. The hand rail could potentially be removed in the future and not change the integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
11. The project, as conditioned, is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents.

WHEREAS, in the opinion of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka, the proposed application should be approved subject to the following conditions:

a. The applicant shall undertake the project as approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Any deviation in proposed design, architectural style, or exterior appearance from those currently proposed shall have prior approval.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka does hereby approve the application, subject to the mitigation and conditions listed above.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka in the County of Humboldt, State of California, on the 3rd day of June, 2020 by the following vote:

AYES: COMMISSIONER
NOES: COMMISSIONER
ABSENT: COMMISSIONER
ABSTAIN: COMMISSIONER

__________________________________
Ted Loring, Chair, Historic Preservation Commission

Attest:

_________________________________
Kristen M. Goetz, Executive Secretary