NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

EUREKA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that the Historic Preservation Commission will hold a public hearing on Wednesday, June 2, 2021, at 4:00 p.m., or as soon thereafter as the matter can be heard. Pursuant to Executive Order N-29-20, by Governor Gavin Newson, this meeting will be conducted telephonically through Zoom. Please be advised that pursuant to the Executive Order and to ensure the health and safety of the public by limiting human contact that could spread the COVID-19 virus, City Hall will not be open for the meeting.

Project Title: Northcoast Children’s Services Porch Alteration

Project Applicant: Northcoast Children’s Services  Case No: HP-21-0001

Project Location: 304 N Street  APN: 001-223-004

Project Zoning and Land Use: DT (Downtown)and DC (Downtown Commercial)

Project Description: The applicant is proposing to enclose the east facing front porch with windows similar to those that exist on the structure. In addition, the existing half-gate will be replaced with French doors. As needed, the modified exterior walls on upper section of the main building will be finished with shake siding and painted to match the existing colors. The parcel contains a 1917, Craftsman-style structure. The property was added to the City of Eureka’s Local Register of Historic Places by a previous owner, and the proposed alteration requires review and approval by the Historic Preservation Commission, pursuant to Chapter 157 of the Eureka Municipal Code.

The public is invited to participate in the following manner:

1. You can view the Historic Preservation Commission meetings live on the City of Eureka’s website at www.ci.eureka.ca.gov or on Cable Channel 10. To view from the website, select Agendas, Meeting and Videos on the home page.

2. If you wish to speak and be heard during the hearing or oral communications, please submit your name, phone number and name of the item you would like to comment on by e-mail to planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov or leave a message at 707-441-4160 on or before June 2, 2021 at 12:00 p.m. A Development Services staff member will call you during the public hearing for the item.

3. If you don’t want to participate during the meeting but want to submit comment on a project or for oral communications, please submit your comment via email to planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov or you may leave a message at 707-441-4160 prior to June 2, 2021 at 12:00 p.m. to ensure that the Commission receives your comment before the
meeting. All comments received by email or mail will be part of the public record for consideration but will not be read aloud during the meeting.

Appeals to the City Council of the action of the Historic Preservation Commission, may be made within 10 calendar days of the action by filing a written Notice of Appeal, along with the filing fees as set by the City Council, with the City Clerk.

If you challenge the nature of the proposed action in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues that you or someone else raised at the public hearing or written correspondence received during or prior to the public hearing. Accommodations for handicapped access to City meetings must be requested of the City Clerk, 441-4175, five working days in advance of the meeting. The project file is available for review by appointment at Development Services - Planning. If you have questions regarding the project or this notice, please contact Development Services - Planning, planning@ci.eureka.ca.gov or (707) 441-4160.
Historic Preservation Commission
STAFF REPORT
June 2, 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject:</th>
<th>Northcoast Children’s Services - Historic Preservation Commission Review HP-21-0001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Location:</td>
<td>304 N Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APN:</td>
<td>001-223-004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicant:</td>
<td>Northcoast Children’s Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property Owner:</td>
<td>Northcoast Children’s Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose/Use:</td>
<td>Enclose the upper portion of the east facing front porch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application Date:</td>
<td>April 28, 2021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Plan:</td>
<td>DC – Downtown Commercial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning:</td>
<td>DT – Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Contact:</td>
<td>Jacob Nunez, Planning Technician</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendation:</td>
<td>Staff recommends the Commission hold a public hearing, and approve the project with conditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motion:</td>
<td>“I move the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a resolution approving the alteration of the east facing front porch of 304 N Street as conditioned.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1: Location Map
Project Summary

The applicant, Northcoast Children Service's, is proposing an alteration of the front porch facing N Street to prevent access to the porch area during non-business hours. The alteration includes enclosing the front porch by adding windows to the south and east facing portions of the porch and replacing the existing metal gate with French doors that match the design of the existing windows.

Background

The property was added to the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP) in 2001 by a previous property owner, and is currently owned by North Coast Children Service's. According to the application for inclusion, the structure was constructed in 1914 and embodies the Craftsman-style. Constructed by an employee of William Carson, the structure was built using local materials and redwood timber products, and has craftsman styles that use clean rectilinear lines and art glass patterns.

As seen in Figure 3, the segments of the exterior structure that embody the Craftsman-style are the raised foundation, front porch, shallow gable roofs that extend beyond the walls with rafters and purlins that project beyond the end of the roof, and the horizontal redwood siding.

A few months ago, the owner added wood to the half-walls to enclose the porch and changed the half-gate to a full-height gate as seen in Figure 4, because the porch was being used as a sleeping area at night. The applicant contacted the City after a complaint was lodged about the alteration, and originally proposed to in-fill the porch openings with wooden shakes over the top of the plywood. Staff suggested that enclosing the porch with glass instead of infilling above the half-walls could help retain the overall style of the building, and provided some examples of closed-in porches on Craftsman-style structures. The applicant agreed, and proposed to enclose the porch with glass windows that will match the existing glass window on the north-facing side of the porch, and to use French doors instead of the metal gate, as shown in Figure 5.

In compliance with Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), the applicant has indicated the porch will not be used for access to the building. Rather, access will be obtained from the entrance on the south side of the structure where an ADA accessible ramp exists.
Figure 3: Previous front of Structure

Figure 4. Existing front of Structure

Figure 5: Proposed Glass Enclosed Porch
Required Findings and Analysis:

Title XV, Chapter 157, of the Eureka Municipal Code, Section 157.006(C), specifies that for properties listed on the Local Register of Historic Places, a proposed alteration must be considered in light of its effect on the existing historical character of the affected structure as it relates to the streetscape. Also, as provided in Chapter 157, the Historic Preservation Commission has adopted the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties as the guidelines for alterations to historic properties and in carrying out their historic preservation responsibilities.

In the Standards, there are four ways that a historic property may be treated; they include Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, and Reconstruction. The most appropriate standard for this project is Rehabilitation. Rehabilitation acknowledges the need to alter or add to a historic property to meet continuing or changing uses while retaining the property’s historic character as it has evolved over time. This treatment standard is chosen by staff because the proposal will alter a historic structure to meet continuing uses while retaining the structure’s historic character.

Rehabilitation is defined as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural significance when possible. There are ten standards to consider when determining if Rehabilitation is the appropriate method of preserving a historic resource:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

   The main structure was historically used as a residence and is currently used as an office. The current use of the property will not be changed as a result of this proposed project.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The overall historic character of the property will be retained and preserved as the change to the exterior façade is the addition of windows to the south and east facing porch walls and a French door at the entrance of the porch. The new windows and French door will mimic the existing windows along the north wall of the porch. There will be no removal of distinctive materials. Although the addition of the windows and French doors will slightly alter the features, space, and spatial relationships that characterize the property, alteration will preserve and enhance the front porch that characterizes the Craftsman style. The alteration will also provide symmetry that will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the existing form.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposal will not include any additions which would create a false sense of historical development. The intent of the project is to maintain the current appearance of the structure by utilizing the same type of windows on north facing side of the porch as a template for the alteration.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

There are no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. The front porch is noted as having historic significance and integrity as a feature of Craftsman-style architecture. The proposed alteration will mimic the existing multi-paned beveled glass design on the north side of the porch, and add it to the east and south facing half-walls of the porch. No part of the structure that has historic significance will be removed.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The alteration of the front porch will not remove any distinctive materials or features that characterize the structure. The enclosure of the half-walls of the porch will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the Craftsman-style architecture.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

No deteriorated historic features are known to exist or will be repaired or replaced.
7. **Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.**

No chemical or physical treatments will be conducted on any part of the existing structure. The added shake siding will be painted to match existing colors.

8. **Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.**

No ground disturbing activities are proposed.

9. **New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.**

The proposed project will alter but not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property as it will expand upon the existing design of the structure. While the new French doors are different from other features on the house, they are similar stylistically due to the glass mimicking the existing multi-paned beveled glass window on the north side of the porch.

10. **New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.**

With the exception of the alteration of the porch, no other new additions or adjacent or related new construction is proposed. The new glass and French doors could potentially be removed in the future and not change the overall integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**Summary of Findings:** Based on the discussion for each standard above, Staff believes the alteration of the front porch does comply with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

The Historic Preservation Commission should review the proposed project to determine whether it is appropriate for the parcel. If the Commission concurs with Staff’s analysis above, and concludes the proposed project does comply with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, the Commission could approve the application.

If the Commission chooses to impose conditions of their own, the Commission must adopt findings supporting their action, and conditions of approval to specify any action that must be taken, including identifying the design, architectural style, and exterior appearance that should be used for the proposed project.

**Environmental:** This project is subject to environmental review in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A project that complies with the Secretary of the
Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents. Because the alteration will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource, this project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from CEQA.

**DOCUMENTS ATTACHED**
Attachment 1: Historic Preservation Commission Resolution 2021-..........................pages 8-9
Attachment 2: Applicant submitted material.................................................................pages 10-14
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 2021-__

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
OF THE CITY OF EUREKA APPROVING THE ALTERATION OF THE FRONT PORCH
AT 304 N STREET, APN 001-223-004

WHEREAS, the subject property at 304 N Street was added to the Local Register of Historic Places (LRHP) by a previous owner in 2001; and

WHEREAS, the residence was constructed in 1914 and is described within the application for inclusion as a Craftsman-Style home that uses clean rectilinear lines and art glass patterns; and

WHEREAS, the property owner has requested approval to enclose the east facing front porch of the Craftsman-style structure to prevent access to the porch area during non-business hours; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka has reviewed the subject application in accordance with Eureka Municipal Code Chapter 157, and after due consideration of all testimony, evidence, and reports offered at the public hearing, does hereby find and determine the following facts:

1. The current use of the property as an office will remain unchanged.
2. The overall historic character of the property will be retained and preserved, and there will be no removal of distinctive materials. Although the enclosing of the front porch with windows and French doors will slightly alter the features, space, and spatial relationships that characterize the property, enclosing the front porch will create symmetry that will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the Craftsman-style architecture.
3. The proposal will not include any additions which would create a false sense of historical development. The intent of the project is to maintain the current appearance of the structure by utilizing the same type of windows on north facing side of the porch as a template for the alteration.
4. There are no changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. The front porch is noted as having historic significance and integrity due to the glass that encloses the north facing wall of the porch. The proposed alteration will mimic the existing multi-paned beveled glass design and add it to the east and south facing half-walls of the porch. No part of the structure that has historic significance will be removed.
5. The alteration of the front porch will not remove any distinctive materials or features that characterize the structure. The front porch is noted for its glass enclosure which the alteration will expand upon to the remaining half-open walls. The enclosure of the half-walls of the porch will mimic and maintain the symmetry of the Craftsman-style architecture.
6. No deteriorated historic features are known to exist or will be repaired or replaced.
7. No chemical or physical treatments will be conducted on any part of the existing structure.
8. All work has and will occur within the existing footprint of the structure, and no ground disturbing activities are proposed.
9. The proposed project will alter but not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial
relationships that characterize the property as it will expand upon the existing design of the structure. While the new French doors are different from other features on the house, they are similar stylistically due to the glass mimicking the existing multi-paned beveled glass window on the north side of the porch.

10. With the exception of the alteration of the porch, no other new additions or adjacent or related new construction is proposed. The new glass and French doors could potentially be removed in the future and not change the overall integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

11. The project, as conditioned, is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and qualifies for a Class 31 exemption from the preparation of environmental documents.

WHEREAS, in the opinion of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka, the proposed application should be approved subject to the following conditions:

    a. The applicant shall undertake the project as approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Any deviation in proposed design, architectural style, or exterior appearance from those currently proposed shall have prior approval.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka does hereby approve the application, subject to the conditions listed above.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Eureka in the County of Humboldt, State of California, on the 2nd day of June, 2021 by the following vote:

AYES: COMMISSIONER
NOES: COMMISSIONER
ABSENT: COMMISSIONER
ABSTAIN: COMMISSIONER

__________________________________
Ted Loring, Chair, Historic Preservation Commission

Attest:

__________________________________
Kristen M. Goetz, Executive Secretary
Plan Description:

This project will enclose the upper sections of the east and south sides of the existing covered porch to prevent frequent drug activity. Existing porch has half walls on the east and south sides and a full wall on the north side with a large bay of windows. The finished project will include enclosing the east and south sides of the porch with windows that match the existing bay of windows on the north side of the porch in style and color to the extent possible. Exterior walls on the porch are to be finished with shake siding painted to match existing shake on upper sections of main building as needed to tie into existing design. Additionally, we will replace the half gate at the entry way with French doors in design and color to match existing windows. To address egress requirements, the porch will no longer be used as an entrance or exit. The entrance/exit will be through the south side of the building which is ADA compliant and meets egress requirements. There is a concrete pathway with ramp that leads from the sidewalk to the door. There is a 6' x 6'6" concrete landing which is level with the entryway. A Signage will be posted inside indicating that the porch is not an exit and signage out front indicating where the entrance is.
Hi kristin,
attached is the signed application for the 304 n st porch enclosure.
please let me know anything else that is needed. and thank you again for your assistance with this process.

have a good day

rodney oien
executive director
northcoast children's services
roien@ncsheadstart.org
(707) 825-1313